The Influence of Personal Characteristics on the Formation of Consumer Preferences for Goods and Services

Sergey V. Babakayev, Marina V. Vinogradova, Victoriya A. Vishnyakova, Kseniya D. Zanina, Anna N. Ermilova

Russian State Social University, Moscow, Russia

Received: 29 April 2018 Accepted: 22 May 2018

Abstract – The research deals with the problem of studying the relationship between personal consumer characteristics and their preferences. The need for a more in-depth study of a personality type and self-image is shown. They are factors which influence consumer behavior. The self-assessment methodology is based on the scales that reveal a wide range of social, institutional, socio-cultural and socio-psychological qualities of respondents. It is a significant factor of their self-consciousness, which largely determines the nature of consumer preferences. The research presents and describes the results of the sociological research, which allowed us to determine the main personal characteristics, values and consumer preferences of respondents, as well as to establish the relationship between these phenomena. On the basis of the analysis the further prospect of studying this problem and its practical significance are shown.

Keywords – consumer preferences, personal characteristics, personality type, values, consumer behavior, scale of self-assessment.

1. INTRODUCTION

Consumer preferences and the factors influencing their formation, still remain the least studied areas of the economic consciousness and consumer behavior. The studies are fragmented. There are a lot of unclear issues related to the essence and content of consumer preferences. The factors and conditions that affect their formation and sustainable manifestation have not been studied.

Despite the fact that the term "consumer preferences" is constantly used in marketing research, at the household level it means "tastes". In science the term appears only indirectly, and its structure, types and properties are still poorly researched and conceptualized (Corrigan, 1996; Douglas, 1996). Meanwhile, there are stable common patterns of this phenomenon. They determine both consumer behavior and consumer needs, which must be studied not only by psychological methods, as it mainly occurs at the present time, but also by sociological methods.

In our research, we define consumer preferences as a positive attitude of the consumer to the attributes of different goods and services, which determines their choice. The choice depends on their personal and social characteristics.

Many researchers of consumer behavior have noticed that without studying and an in-depth analysis of consumer preferences we can see only external and superficial reasons of consumer behavior. They seem rational and can explain consumer behavior (Clarke, 1998; Miles, 1998; Statt, 2012; Vinogradova et al., 2016). In fact, the consumer is controlled by hidden unconscious reasons and factors that run counter to the idea of the rational choice and are determined by personal tastes.
According to the national American research program USDA, consumer preference is the main driver of most changes observed over the past decade in many commodity markets (Nelson, 2011). At the same time, it should be noted that most works devoted to this issue deal with certain effects and aspects of consumer preferences, or are mainly descriptive or purely applied (Rozmainsky and Kholodilin, 2000; Foxal, 2002).

The main object of the research is consumer preferences. They are regarded in a fairly broad section of their attribute characteristics, including more than 20 features that reflect the key aspects of this phenomenon. The subject of the research is the personal characteristics that determine the choice of certain goods and services and underlie consumer preferences (Roshchina, 2006). The main objectives of the research are to identify the main characteristics of consumer preferences, to determine the socio-cultural and socio-psychological portrait of the audience on the basis of evaluation scales, the views of individuals and their personal characteristics. All this is aimed at determining the impact of personal characteristics on the formation of consumer preferences in the selection of goods and services. It is achieved through establishing a relationship between the variables that display and record the values of the studied features reflecting these phenomena.

Consumer behavior is determined by many determinants. Each of them influences our preferences in the selection of goods and services that we buy every day (Fig. 1). It should be noted that basically all of them are considered from the point of view of the consumer economic activity in the market. In this regard, the following main determinants can be identified (Knight, 1999):

1. Income. A number of specialists consider this factor to be the strongest, since it determines the product type and quantity a population or an individual can afford to buy.
2. Infrastructure of the country. It includes distribution systems, transport communications, possibilities to use the Internet, telephone, availability of vehicles.
3. Cultural traditions. It predetermines the culture of consumer behavior in the market, as well as the range of goods and services that are purchased by the country as a whole.

Geographic features, climate, population mobility and specific situations in a particular country or region are factors that often influence consumer behavior in the market.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>External factors</th>
<th>Internal factors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Environmental factors:</td>
<td>Marketin factors:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture, subculture, social class;</td>
<td>Product, distribution, price,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>reference groups, family, roles</td>
<td>promotion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and status</td>
<td>Psychological factors:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Needs, motives, education,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>attitude, opinion, assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Personal factors:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Age, lifestyle, work, economic conditions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the research, we have put forward the following assumption: consumer preferences are a holistic approach, which is a close relationship between the personal characteristics and values of consumers.

The research is devoted to the study of the relationship between the components of consumer preferences and personal characteristics. They are identified and verified with the help of empirical referents that reflect both the values of respondents and their social, socio-cultural, socio-psychological personal qualities.
represented by a wide range of features and characteristics.

2. METHOD

The main method of our research on the personal characteristics and nature of consumer preferences was a sociological survey. It was conducted in the form of an electronic questionnaire on the Internet portal of RSSU. The portal is attended by students, teachers and University staff members. It is difficult to use such surveys in marketing research, as it requires compliance with clear parameters of the target audience. Despite the fact that online surveys do not allow us to speak in a strict sense about the representativeness of the data obtained, they are of an important cognitive interest. In particular, they help to develop tools, scientific testing and correction of hypotheses, to identify and select the most important indicators, including indicators of consumer preferences and personal characteristics based on self-assessments and perceptions of the respondents. A total of 443 respondents were interviewed: 19% of them were men and 81% women. The average age of respondents was 26 years old. The vast majority studied and worked at the same time (89%). By type of employment, respondents were divided into approximately equal parts: 48% and 47% work in the public (budget) and commercial sectors of the economy, respectively. A significant part of the respondents (60%) are Moscow residents. The absolute majority consider themselves to be middle class (87%) and are characterized by active consumer behavior. This is evidenced by the following figures: 51% and 62% of respondents visit large shopping centers and large chain stores at least once a week, respectively.

The research procedure was carried out in the period from April to May 2018.

To achieve the goals of the study of different consumer preferences aspects, an electronic questionnaire was developed. It consisted of a number of conditional blocks of questions. They included three sets of questions directly related to our analysis. The first block was designed to collect information on the structure of consumer preferences and the main attributes that determine the choice of goods and services. Twenty-five most significant features were selected. They included the following set of attribute and reference characteristics of the product selection: "price"; "quality"; "brand"; "packaging"; "composition"; "manufacturer"; "material"; "type of product"; "usefulness"; "brand reputation"; "advertising attractiveness"; "past shopping experience"; "recommendations of friends"; "reviews on the Internet"; "advice of relatives and close people" and other features, defining consumer preferences. We chose these features on the basis of the marketing research analysis and the main criteria by which the structure of consumer preferences and their main attribute properties are regarded and estimated in scientific works (Gusler, 2004; Tarasova, 2012).

It should be noted that American researchers consider consumer preferences through the benefits that a product or service can give (Knight, 1999). At the same time, Russian researchers do not put the main emphasis on the benefits the consumer is looking for. They pay attention to the attributes of the product that provide these benefits (Petrenko, 1983; Zelizer, 2005).

The assessment of structural elements of consumer choice was carried out on a 7-point scale (from "very important" to "absolutely not important"), by the self-assessment method. The respondent defined the importance of each factor affecting their consumer choice.

The second set of questions was aimed at identifying the importance of the respondent's values. This information is necessary to adequately represent the social needs of different levels and order
realized in the process of consumer choice (Lancaster K., 2000). It included questions determining the severity of respondent’s values that make up Maslow's hierarchy of needs. They determine consumer preferences and consumer behavior in general (Kh’ell and Zigler, 2011). Among them there are such values and needs as: "security", "well-being", "stability", "self-respect", "self-development", "recognition", "status", "power", "wealth", "glory", "beauty", "adventure" and others. In total, there are about 20 semantic categories of these features. Each category was evaluated by the respondent in terms of their importance on a 7-point scale.

The third set of questions fixed personal characteristics of respondents. The basis for the selection of a wide range of features to identify personal characteristics was the idea, which was based on the personality traits theory developed by R. Cattell (Cattell, 1990), and methodically implemented by constructing a semantic differential. The respondents were asked to rate themselves on a 7-point scale according to the proposed personal characteristics, which together represented the personality type. The semantic approach was the basis of the model formation of personal characteristics of respondents, which identified the type of personality. This approach is often used to define personality traits (Kelly, 1955). These features (social, psychological, situational and other personal characteristics) were set in the continuum of their polar, opposite meanings (Wright, 1987; Zelizer, 2005). This is a self-description (self-characterization) of the individual using a system of values based on their personal ideas about themselves.

The scale is reminiscent of the psychosemantic scale of technology methods widely used by psychologists. They are lists of descriptors (trait descriptions) by which the subject should evaluate or describe himself or herself or other persons. Moreover, this assessment occurs on certain scales, the poles of which are indicated by short names (Shmelev, 1983; Lyubimova, 2004; Mises, 2008).

Forty-four pairs of polar values of social, institutional, socio-cultural, civilizational personality traits which cover a wide range of behavioral, mental, emotional and volitional, social and psychological characteristics of the personality were used to study the personal characteristics of the respondents. They reflected in sufficient detail the social profile of the surveyed audience. The respondents tried to identify their personal characteristics among the following pairs of polar features: for example, "rational-emotional"; "ambitious-modest"; "independent-slave"; "adventurous-prudent"; "extreme-calm"; "active-inert"; "creative-adequate"; "aggressive-friendly"; "happy-unhappy", etc.. An important place in the structure of the qualities through which personal characteristics are "sifted" and the social profile of respondents and their social character are formed, was given to socio-cultural, socio-political and institutional personal characteristics. In particular, such polar features as: "religious-non-religious"; "nationalist-internationalist"; "liberal-conservative"; "educated-ignorant", etc.

The respondent, based on their self-assessment, was asked to determine their place in the continuum between different polar signs, using a 7-point scale. Thus, the developed questionnaire allowed creation of a comprehensive portrait of the respondents and generated a detailed image of the target audience in many ways.

3. **RESULTS**

Analysis of the distribution of respondent’s answers to the question: "please rate the importance of each factor affecting your choice of goods and services" showed that the most important factors were "reliability, warranty, safety" of goods or services.
This attribute property is "extremely (absolutely) important" for 63% of respondents. Note that we specifically analyzed the extreme position in each polar pair of features to form the groups with clearer and less blurred boundaries of their consumer preferences.

The second place in the number of preferences was taken by such an attribute property of a product or service as "quality." Forty-nine respondents noted its "absolute importance".

The third, fourth and fifth places were taken by "price," "utility" and "composition" of goods or services that are the most significant (extremely important) for 43% of respondents.

In the ranking of the 10 most important qualities that determine the choice of the surveyed audience there are the following product attributes: "past experience" (36%); "technical characteristics" (35%); "type of goods" (33%); "material" (31%); "environmental friendliness" (30%).

Thus, the survey showed that the respondents' consumer preferences are both attributive and functional. It is not only a choice of quality parameters of the product. It is a choice of functional characteristics associated with the benefits that it brings, as well as significant communicative and social effects. At the same time, the survey revealed that the external factors influencing the consumer when choosing a product are quite limited. Such factors of consumer choice as "advertising", "seller's advice" have "absolute value" only for 7% of respondents. They are in the lowest position in the conditional rating of qualities determining consumer behavior.

According to the comparative analysis of the data on the block "importance of values", the "social field" of consumer preferences is closely correlated with the "social field" of values, creating a certain "habitus" that affects "social practices" of consumer behavior.

The analysis of the distribution of respondent's answers in the block of questions related to the assessment of certain values revealed the following facts. The most significant values of life for the respondents are "security" (47% of respondents), "self-esteem" (46%), "love" (45%), "well-being" (44%), "self-development" (42%). The following values follow in descending order: "friendship" (41%), "stability" (40%), "self-realization" (39%), "respect" (38%), "prosperity" (35%), "nature" (33%), "recognition" (21%), "beauty" (20%). It should be noted that the values of "power" (6%), "fame" (7%), "wealth" (9%), "change" (10%), "status" (16%), and "adventure" (16%) are the least important for the respondents. However, despite the relatively low prevalence in the survey, these life values play a very important role for a fairly stable group of consumers. This fact cannot be ignored.

The answers to the questionnaire defined a wide range of features reflecting different sides of the socio-psychological, socio-cultural and ideological profile of the individual and their social temperament. They also revealed a rather complex, multi-faceted and multicultural nature of the audience survey.

At this stage, we have not carried out a typology analysis of these features on a wide range of social qualities in their complexity, unity and consistency. It is planned to do it in the future, so we will present only the distribution of these qualities among the surveyed population of respondents. The most typical social qualities that respondents give themselves in the process of self-assessment are the following features and signs of social self-portrait: "educated" (45% of respondents indicated a strong expression of this quality); "cultural" (42%); "educated" (41%); "responsible" (40%). Further prevailing qualities were: "independent" (36%); "lucky, happy" (34%); "strong" (33%); "friendly" (32%); "humanitarian" (31%); "patriot" (30%), "religious" (29%);
"collectivist" (29%); "sporty" (29%). Every fourth or fifth respondent noted the following qualities: "modern" (28%); "confident" (27%); "fashionable" (27%); "carefully planning" (26%); "globalist" (25%); "liberal" (25%); "apolitical" (25%); "creative" (24%). Despite the fact that these features of social self-portrait reflect the characteristics of a specific audience of teachers and students of the state university, and mainly with a humanitarian focus. This does not allow us to extrapolate these results to a wider set of Russian consumers. However, these facts are of great interest. First of all, from the point of view of identification and determination of relations between the indicators of consumer preferences and personal characteristics, which are verified and interpreted in semantic terms of "life values" and personal traits of "social character" in the broad sense of this concept. The correlation analysis carried out between the features of different blocks of questions reflecting consumer preferences, on the one hand, and life values, as well as personal traits, on the other hand, revealed certain dependencies between them. This can be regarded as the influence of personal characteristics on the formation of consumer preferences in the selection of goods and services.

In particular, the following significant positive and negative correlations (p < 0.01) were found between a number of features characterizing consumer preferences and variables representing life values and personal characteristics based on self-assessment (Table 1):

[Table 1 here]

Correlation analysis revealed a number of interesting features, which are interdependent in the following way:

First, the attribute characteristics of consumer preferences (composition, quality, reliability) have a significantly meaningful positive correlation with such values as safety, stability, self-respect and well-being. There has also been revealed their positive correlation with such traits as being responsible, independent and solid.

Second, the functional characteristics of consumer preferences based on "utility" have significant positive correlation with such values as self-development and self-realization. Their positive correlation with such social and psychological traits of the individual as rational, carefully planning and solid has also been revealed.

Third, when "price" is the most important factor, the consumer preferences show a significantly positive correlation with such values as self-assessment and wealth. Along with this, a significantly negative correlation with such values as wealth, status and power has been revealed. There is a positive correlation with the following social traits: carefully planning, modest, adequate and rational.

4. DISCUSSION

The research results allowed us to better understand the structure and properties of the main elements of consumer preferences and to focus on further study of the problem of consumer subjectivity. This issue is becoming increasingly important in social interaction. We believe that the consumer "subjectivity" associated with their active economic behavior is more productive than "consumer behavior" in disclosing "consumer preferences" through the scientific category (conceptual model).

In our opinion, this is due to the fact that consumer preferences can be considered as a link between personal characteristics (traits and characteristics of social character, life values, etc.) and consumer behavior (Blackwell et al., 1999; Clark, 2002; Becker, 2003). Their role is to filter and identify the needs, values, individual traits and socio-cultural type of personality for a particular product and service (Posypanova, 2012).
Considering the relationship between the consumer subjectivity and the consumer behavior in terms of consumer preferences, we believe that the existing scientific classification, suggested by S. von Venstrom and Robert Pollack (Marc and Indrajit, 2001) is practical. It divides consumer preferences into endogenous (of internal origin, which are based on intrapersonal variables, past experience, values, self-expression and social traits) and exogenous (of external origin, based on advertising, advice from friends, relatives and other external factors). We took this classification as the basis for developing the research tools.

There are many approaches to the structuring of consumer preferences in the scientific literature. But despite this fact, for different reasons most authors emphasize that consumer preferences are influenced by the same factors as consumer behavior. It is from this position that we proceeded in the analysis of the personal characteristics impact on the formation of consumer preferences. When developing the tools, we used the ideas of the conceptual model of M. Sobel and I. Sinh (Nelson, 2011). According to them, consumer preferences are mainly influenced by factors, which are structured into several groups (blocks) of variables. They are perceived risk (reliability, safety), quality variations, price awareness, brand reputation, brand orientation within the price category and others. The authors advise to include into the questionnaire the maximum list of possible aspects that reveal consumer preferences and their factors (Kapelyushnikov, 1993; Aleshina, 2003, Durovich, 2005). Moreover, the list of the maximum possible values is recommended to be evaluated on 7-point scale, placing them from a lesser degree of to a greater one. Then the weights of each risk should be calculated.

These provisions, with some variations to the Russian conditions, allowed us to measure different aspects of consumer preferences. Within the framework of this model, the main emphasis was placed on the attribute properties of the product and its functional use. This allowed us to identify the social needs and interests that underlie consumer preferences and describe the impact of different factors on their formation. When studying American consumer preferences, Gary A. Knight (Knight, 1999) noted that consumer preference is heavily influenced by the country in which the product is made. And it is the country of production, not the national origin of the company. Our analysis of the Russian audience has not revealed such a pattern. According to our survey, the country of production in the structure of consumer preferences is not the most important. It is at the end of the list of desirable qualities of goods and services (19-20%). This can also be applied to the support of domestic producers when choosing a product or service (the importance of this factor was noted by only 18% of respondents). It should be noted that 30% of respondents consider themselves to be "patriots". The analysis revealed that this self-identification is a certain correlation when choosing a domestic manufacturer (r = 0.268; p<0.01).

The conclusion made by Dan Erieli (Dan, 2000) on the basis of the study of American consumers is that information flows (advertising, friend’s advice, recommendations of specialists, sellers and consultants) are one of the main factors. The Israel-American scientist believes that this factor determines consumer preferences and decisions in the selection of goods and services to the greatest extent (Jerry, 1999; Il'in, 2005.). According to our results, this factor plays an undoubted role, but it is not decisive (its weight is from 0.07 to 0.16).

Our results, reflecting the structure and factors of consumer preferences formation based on personal characteristics, partially correspond to the model of consumer preferences proposed by Michael Albert and Robert R. Hane l(Michael and Robin,
In their model, the main factor determining consumer behavior was tastes (consumer preferences), which were primarily a function of past experience in the selection of goods and services.

At the same time, our model of consumer preferences is largely inconsistent with the model of consumer preferences and its determining factors proposed by such authors as L. Simon-Rusinowitz and K. Mahoney (Simon-Rusinowitz and Mahoney, 2001). In their research, they identified three factors determining consumer preferences: national culture; independence/control of the perceived ratio of income and price of goods (cash-option). According to our results, national culture does not have its dominant influence on consumer choice.

Based on the results presented above in the table with correlations, we can say that there is a significant relationship between consumer preferences in the selection of goods and services, life values and parameters of human self-esteem. Thus, our hypothesis that consumer preference is a holistic education of closely interrelated elements, namely the basic values of life, the type of personality, manifested through self-assessment, self-image and a wide range of socio-cultural and social traits, has been confirmed.

5. CONCLUSION

The results show that there are some correlations between certain consumer preferences in the selection of goods and services and personal characteristics of respondents.

At the same time, summarizing the results, we can also state that our attempt to find the main, system-forming component of consumer preferences and personal characteristics, closely related to all its other elements, was not successful.

Nevertheless, the conducted empirical study outlined further prospects for studying the impact of personal characteristics on the formation of consumer preferences as a complex phenomenon through the separation of its components and the identification of their relationships.

Our next step will be to deepen the knowledge of the relationship between consumer preferences and correlations affecting their formation. All this is planned to be carried out through cluster analysis of the values, building a typology of life values and personal characteristics on the basis of variations and combinations of the identified parameters of different qualities of social character, as well as through the allocation of the main social types by the nature of consumer preferences, life values and social traits. This will allow us to compare not only the impact of some features on others, but also to see and analyze how different types (clusters) of respondents are related.

In the future, it is planned to consider what personal characteristics and preferences each of the selected psychological types has and how this can be taken into account when forming tours and offers to tourists. Fulfilling this rule, the seller will meet the needs that guide consumers.

The results of our research can be recommended to be used by marketing specialists who are focused on target audiences close in their parameters to the surveyed group of the capital's youth: they belong to the middle class, works and at the same time improve their education. Knowledge of the basic personal characteristics of this group and the specifics of its consumer preferences will help to predict their consumer behavior regarding the choice of different goods and services.

We would like to thank all the teachers and students who took part in our survey and gave sincere and complete answers to the questions. This allowed us to investigate
this complex and multifaceted topic in more detail.

References


Table 1: Correlation between consumer preferences in the selection of goods and services and personal characteristics (n = 443)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Consumer preference</th>
<th>Personal characteristic</th>
<th>Social and psychological traits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Safety (r = 0.312), self-assessment (r = 0.301), stability (r = 0.297), well-being (r = 0.254), self-realization (r = 0.229)</td>
<td>Responsible (r = 0.350), independent (r = 0.302), confident (r = 0.296), calm (r = 0.285), ambitious (r = 0.230)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety (r = 0.310), self-esteem (r = 0.286), stability (r = 0.233)</td>
<td>Rational (r = 0.357), carefully planning (r = 0.328), solid (r = 0.292), responsible (r = 0.232)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changes (r = - 0.387), self-development (r = - 0.354), safety (r = 0.321), stability (r = 0.312)</td>
<td>Doubting (r = 0.412), adequate (r = 0.354), inert (r = 0.305), classical (r = 0.286), conservative (r = 0.280)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wealth (r = - 0.362), status (r = - 0.318), power (r = - 0.300), self-assessment (r = 0.296), well-being (r = 0.236)</td>
<td>Calculating (r = 0.333), modest (r = 0.316), adequate (r = 0.302), rational (r = 0.286), carefully planning (r = 0.266), needy (r = 0.248)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beauty (r = 0.388), adventure (r = 0.340), wealth (r = 0.298), fame (r = 0.276)</td>
<td>Fashionable (r = 0.406), hedonist (r = 0.320), &quot;happy/successful&quot; (r = 0.303), modern (r = 0.300), brutal (r = 0.276), wealthy (r = 0.266), shocking (r = 0.234)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nature (r = 0.331), safety (r = 0.303), prosperity (r = 0.252)</td>
<td>Doubting (r = 0.343), emotional (r = 0.324), active (r = 0.316), glamorous (r = 0.288)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-assessment (r = 0.331), status (r = 0.302), wealth (r = 0.300), fame (r = 0.286), power (r = 0.268)</td>
<td>Apolitical (r = 0.322), strong (r = 0.312), adventurous (r = 0.308), independent (r = 0.300), aggressive (r = 0.287), pathos (r = 0.266), elite (r = 0.234), sporty (r = 0.221)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stability (r = 0.318), safety (r = 0.312)</td>
<td>Nihilist (r = 0.318), professional (r = 0.316), patriot (r = 0.302), independent (r = 0.297), globalist (r = 0.286), cultural (r = 0.259)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advice from other people and different reference groups</td>
<td>Friendship (r = 0.354), love (r = 0.340), respect (r = 0.302), safety (r = 0.262)</td>
<td>Educated (r = 0.326), collectivist (r = 0.318), loser (r = 0.306), patriot (r = 0.288), romantic (r = 0.286)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising</td>
<td>Changes (r = 0.353), beauty (r = 0.311), status (r = 0.290), adventures (r = 0.284)</td>
<td>Enthusiast (r = 0.308), glamorous (r = 0.302), apolitical (r = 0.300), affectionate (r = 0.283), shocking (r = 0.266)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>